

Public Health (Further Extension of Declared Public Health Emergency—COVID-19) Regulation (No. 4) 2020

Human Rights Certificate

Prepared in accordance with Part 3 of the *Human Rights Act 2019*

In accordance with section 41 of the *Human Rights Act 2019*, I, the Honourable Steven Miles MP, Deputy Premier and Minister for Health and Minister for Ambulance Services provide this human rights certificate with respect to the *Public Health (Further Extension of Declared Public Health Emergency—COVID-19) Regulation (No. 4) 2020* made under the *Public Health Act 2005*.

In my opinion, the *Public Health (Further Extension of Declared Public Health Emergency—COVID-19) Regulation (No. 4) 2020*, as tabled in the Legislative Assembly, is compatible with the human rights protected by the Human Rights Act. I base my opinion on the reasons outlined in this statement.

Overview of the Subordinate Legislation

Chapter 8 of the *Public Health Act 2005* deals with public health emergencies. Under section 319 of the Act, the Minister may declare a public health emergency by a signed written order. The public health emergency takes effect from its declaration by the Minister.

A declared public health emergency activates a range of powers and functions under chapter 8 of the Act. For example, emergency officers have wide ranging powers under chapter 8 to assist in responding to a public health emergency, including powers of entry and a range of powers to compel persons to do or refrain from certain activities. Emergency officers (medical) have additional powers relating to the detention of persons.

In December 2019 and January 2020, a new coronavirus emerged in Wuhan City, in the Hubei Province of China and was given the temporary name of 2019-nCoV (it was renamed on 11 February 2020 by the World Health Organization and is now known as COVID-19).

On 29 January 2020, a public health emergency was declared under section 319 of the Public Health Act due to the outbreak of 2019-nCoV within China, its pandemic potential due to cases spreading to other countries and the public health implications within Queensland resulting from recently arrived travellers from the epicentre of the outbreak. The public health emergency was declared for all of Queensland. A copy of the public health emergency order was published in the Government Gazette on 31 January 2020.

Prior to 7 February 2020, under sections 322 and 323 of the Public Health Act, a declared public health emergency ends seven days after the day it is declared, unless extended by a regulation. On 7 February 2020, the *Public Health (Declared Public Health Emergencies) Amendment Act 2020* amended the Public Health Act to allow a declared public health emergency to be extended by regulation for periods of up to 90 days. However, this amendment is subject to a sunset clause that takes effect one year from Royal Assent of the Amendment Act, which reverts the period to 14 days.

The declared public health emergency has been extended by regulation as follows:

- On 5 and 6 February 2020, the declared public health emergency was extended by the *Public Health (Extension of Declared Public Health Emergency—Coronavirus (2019-nCoV)) Regulation 2020* and the *Public Health (Further Extension of Declared Public Health Emergency—Coronavirus (2019-nCoV)) Regulation 2020*, which collectively extended the declared public health emergency for 2019-CoV until 19 February 2020.
- The *Public Health (Further Extension of Declared Public Health Emergency—Coronavirus (2019-nCoV)) Regulation (No. 2) 2020* extended the period of the declared public health emergency by 90 days, until 19 May 2020.
- On 18 May 2020, the *Public Health (Further Extension of Declared Public Health Emergency—COVID-19) Regulation (No. 3) 2020* extended the period of the declared public health emergency by 90 days, until 17 August 2020.

As at 30 July 2020, the World Health Organization had reported a total of 17,039,160 confirmed positive COVID-19 cases reported globally. As at 29 July 2020, the Australian Government Department of Health reported 15,582 confirmed COVID-19 cases, including 176 deaths in Australia.

The response to COVID-19 across Australia has continued, with sustained community transmission leading to a significant increase in the number of positive COVID-19 cases in the past month in Victoria and New South Wales. As at 30 July 2020, Victoria recorded 9,998 positive COVID-19 cases with 1,698 cases possibly attributed to community transmission. This continues to create a risk that COVID-19 may spread to other parts of Australia as people continue to attempt to leave Victoria for various reasons, including work and on compassionate grounds. This has resulted in the Queensland Government taking action to deny entry to people who have been in Victoria and some parts of New South Wales in the past 14 days (unless they meet criteria for entry), through the Chief Health Officer declaring COVID-19 hot spots for the purposes of the Border Restrictions Direction (No. 9).

As of 30 July 2020, there were 1,083 confirmed cases of COVID-19 in Queensland. Sadly, there have been six deaths relating to COVID-19 being Queensland residents. While the response to COVID-19 in Queensland has meant that social distancing restrictions have been able to ease, this does not mean that the risk of COVID-19 spreading throughout Queensland has been eliminated. Although the number of active cases and instances of community transmission of COVID-19 in Queensland has been relatively low, the risk of an uncontrollable outbreak in the absence of emergency powers remains high. For example, the situation in Victoria means there is still a risk that COVID-19 could spread to other parts of Australia, including Queensland.

To ensure the Queensland Government can continue to respond to any potential outbreak of COVID-19 in Queensland, it is critical the declared public health emergency be extended until at least 2 October 2020. The *Public Health (Further Extension of Declared Public Health Emergency—COVID-19) Regulation (No. 4) 2020* extends the period of the declared public health emergency to allow for emergency powers to be used to reduce the risk of COVID-19 spreading. The Regulation extends the declared public health emergency until 2 October 2020.

Queensland Health is in regular contact with clinicians and the general public about the developing COVID-19 situation. Queensland Health will continue to ensure that Queenslanders are informed about the COVID-19, including any confirmed cases and actions that can be taken to reduce the risk of the COVID-19 spreading.

In accordance with section 324 of the Public Health Act, if the Minister becomes satisfied it is no longer necessary to exercise powers to respond to COVID-19 to prevent or minimise serious adverse effects on human health, the Minister must end the declared public health emergency and make a written record of the time and date the declared public health emergency ends.

Human Rights Issues

Human rights relevant to the subordinate legislation (Part 2, Division 2 and 3 *Human Rights Act 2019*)

The Regulation extends the powers of emergency officers under the Public Health Act. These powers include: requiring a person to not enter or not remain within a place; stay in a stated place; and stop using a place for a stated purpose. Failure to comply with these requirements without reasonable excuse is an offence with a maximum penalty of 100 penalty units.

Emergency officers (medical) also have the power to order detention of a person if that person has or may have a serious disease or illness. As soon as practicable after a person is detained, an emergency officer (medical) must request that the person be medically examined. Failure to comply with a detention order is an offence with a maximum penalty of 200 penalty units.

In my opinion, the human rights that are relevant to the subordinate legislation are:

- Right to life (section 16)
- Freedom of movement (section 19)
- Freedom of thought, conscience, religion and belief (section 20)
- Freedom of expression (section 21)
- Peaceful assembly and freedom of association (section 22)
- Taking part in public life (section 23)
- Property rights (section 24)
- Privacy and reputation (section 25)
- Protection of families (section 26(1))
- Protection of children (section 26(2))
- Cultural rights – generally (section 27)
- Cultural rights – Aboriginal peoples and Torres Strait Islander peoples (section 28)
- Right to liberty and security of person (section 29)
- Right to humane treatment when deprived of liberty (section 30)
- Right to education (section 36)

Consideration of reasonable limitations on human rights (section 13 *Human Rights Act 2019*)

(a) the nature of the right

Right to life

The right to life imposes substantive and procedural obligations on the State to take appropriate steps and adopt positive measures to protect life. The Regulation promotes the right to life by extending the length of the declared public health emergency until 2 October 2020, which continues to allow emergency officers to issue directions and exercise powers under the Public Health Act to contain the spread of COVID-19, which is known to be fatal in some cases. Therefore, the right to life is not limited by the regulation.

Freedom of movement; Right to privacy and reputation

Section 19 of the Human Rights Act provides that every person lawfully within Queensland has the right to move freely within Queensland and to enter and leave it and has the freedom to choose where to live.

The Regulation has the potential to limit this right, as the powers available to emergency officers under the Public Health Act activated by the Regulation include: requiring a person to not enter or not remain within a place; stay in a stated place; and stop using a place for a stated purpose. Failure to comply with these requirements without reasonable excuse is an offence with a maximum penalty of 100 penalty units. Emergency officers (medical) also have the power to order detention of a person if that person has or may have a serious disease or illness. As soon as practicable after a person is detained, an emergency officer (medical) must request that the person be medically examined. Failure to comply with a detention order is an offence with a maximum penalty of 200 penalty units.

Freedom of thought, conscience, religion and belief; Freedom of expression; Peaceful assembly and freedom of association; Cultural rights – generally; Cultural rights – Aboriginal peoples and Torres Strait Islander peoples

The Regulation extends the powers of emergency officers under the Public Health Act, which allows them to: prohibit a person from entering or remaining within a place; stay in a stated place; and stop using a place for a stated purpose. Failure to comply with these requirements without reasonable excuse is an offence with a maximum penalty of 100 penalty units. In addition, emergency officers (medical) have the power to order detention of a person if that person has or may have a serious disease or illness. As soon as practicable after a person is detained, an emergency officer (medical) must request that the person be medically examined. Failure to comply with a detention order is an offence with a maximum penalty of 200 penalty units.

The right to freedom of thought, conscience, religion and belief includes the freedom to demonstrate the person's religion or belief 'either individually or as part of a community, in public or in private' (section 20(1)(b) of the Human Rights Act). The right to hold a belief is so important that it is considered to be an absolute right, however limits on how a person manifests their belief can be justified. As the Regulation extends powers of emergency officers to order a person to self-isolate or to otherwise restrict a person's or group's movements, this may limit the ability of people to publicly demonstrate and practice their religion or beliefs.

The right to freedom of expression includes the freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds. It protects almost all kinds of expression, as long as it conveys or attempts to convey a meaning. Ideas and opinions can be expressed in various ways, including in writing, through art, or orally. While the concept of freedom of expression is broad, the way people can exercise it can be limited. As the Regulation extends the powers of emergency officers under the Public Health Act to restrict a person's movement and contacts with others, this may limit the ways in which people can express their opinions and ideas.

The right to peaceful assembly is the right of individuals to gather for a common purpose or to pursue common goals. It protects both participants and organisers of peaceful assemblies. The Regulation extends powers of emergency officers, which may restrict a person's movements any limit the ability of people to peacefully assemble.

Cultural rights protect the rights of all people with particular cultural, religion, racial and linguistic backgrounds to enjoy their culture, declare and practice their religion, and use their language in community. It promotes the right to practise and maintain shared traditions and activities, and recognises that enjoying one's culture is intertwined with the capacity to do so in connection with others from the same cultural background. In addition to the general cultural rights, the Human Rights Act recognises that Aboriginal peoples and Torres Strait Islander peoples hold distinct cultural rights as Australia's first people. They have the right to enjoy, maintain, control, protect and develop their culture, language and kinship ties with other members of their community. The right also protects Aboriginal peoples and Torres Strait Islander peoples' right to maintain and strengthen their distinct spiritual relationship with the land, territories, waters, coastal seas and other resources, and to conserve and protect the environment.

The Regulation extends the powers of emergency officers under the Public Health Act, including the power to order persons to self-isolate, or to otherwise restrict the movement of groups and individuals. As a result, this may limit cultural rights generally and the rights of Aboriginal peoples and Torres Strait Islander peoples to engage with community and their traditionally owned or otherwise occupied lands and waters.

Taking part in public life

Every person in Queensland has the right to take part in public life. This includes the right to participate in the conduct of public affairs and the right to vote and be elected at periodic State and local government elections. Being part of community consultations with government, attending local council meetings, participating in public debate, and taking part in referendums or other electoral processes are important aspects of taking part in public life. The right to take part in public life does not mean the right to access public space through the use of public transport.

The Regulation has the potential to limit this right, as the powers provided to emergency officers include restricting the movement of persons; requiring persons to stay at or in a stated place; requiring persons not to enter or stay at or in a stated place; and restricting contact between persons. For example, individuals subject to directions to self-isolate or otherwise restrict their movements, or who are affected by restrictions placed on access to particular facilities, will be temporarily limited in the ways in which they can take part in public life.

Property rights

Section 24 of the Human Rights Act provides that a person must not be arbitrarily deprived of the person's property. The powers available to emergency officers, activated and extended by the Regulation, for the declared public health emergency have the potential to limit this right.

In particular, emergency officers have the power to: demolish stated structures or other property; remove an animal, substance or thing from a place; dispose of an animal, substance or thing at a place; destroy animals at a place or remove animals at a place for destruction at another place; and take action in relation to property including, for example, to allow the officer to take control of a building for the purposes of the emergency.

Privacy and reputation

The nature of the right to privacy and reputation is very broad but contains internal limitations. The protection against interference with privacy is limited to unlawful or arbitrary interference. The notion of arbitrary interference extends to those interferences which may be lawful, but are unreasonable, unnecessary and disproportionate.

The Regulation extends the powers of emergency officers under the Public Health Act for the purpose of protecting the health of the public by managing the potential spread of COVID-19. It is reasonable, necessary and proportionate to limit the rights of a person in order to protect the health of the public in the context of a public health emergency. The powers ensure Queensland Health is able to understand the epidemiology of COVID-19, which can be used to develop strategies to protect public health, and to determine other information that may be relevant to responding to a declared public health emergency.

Right to liberty and security of person

The nature of the right to liberty and security is to protect personal liberty, but it is focused on the requirement that due process is followed when state authorities exercise their powers of detention. It is not the deprivation of liberty that is prohibited but that which is arbitrary or unlawful.

The right to freedom of movement is based upon Article 12 of the *International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights* (ICCPR). The ICCPR states in part that the right shall not be subject to any restrictions except those which are provided by law and are necessary to protect public health.

The Regulation extends the emergency powers provided to emergency officers under the Public Health Act which include the power to restrict the movement of persons; require persons to stay at or in a stated place; require persons not to enter or stay at or in a stated place; and restrict contact between persons. For example, a direction to self-isolate at home or at another premises, or to otherwise restrict a person's movements, may limit the right to liberty and security because preventing people from leaving their homes or other premises constitutes detention.

This right is subject to a number of internal limitations and qualifications. Relevantly, the detention must not be arbitrary in the sense that it must not be capricious, unpredictable or unjust or otherwise disproportionate to the legitimate aim that is sought. The powers of emergency officers are clearly defined and subject to limits, for example, the person giving the direction or order must reasonably believe that it is necessary to assist in containing or responding to the spread of COVID-19.

Right to protection of families

Queensland recognises families as the fundamental unit of society entitled to protection. This right encompasses more than non-interference; it is a guarantee of institutional protection of the family by society and the state. ‘Family’ is interpreted broadly, extending to different cultural understandings of family. Internal limitations of lawfulness and arbitrariness apply to the right of the family.

The Regulation extends the emergency powers provided to emergency officers under the Public Health Act which include the power to restrict the movement of persons; require persons to stay at or in a stated place; require persons not to enter or stay at or in a stated place; and restrict contact between persons. This may limit this right due to physical separation of families, whereby a person may be ordered to self-isolate or a facility such as a facility such as an aged care facility is directed to restrict access to visitors.

This limitation would be temporary and would not restrict other means of communication and engagement among family members, for example through phone calls, video conferencing or social media. The limitation on the right to protection of families would also not be arbitrary, as the actions would be taken in an effort to protect the health and safety of family members and the wider community.

Right to protection of children

Every child has the right, without discrimination, to the protection that is in their best interests as a child. The right recognises that special measures to protect children are necessary given their vulnerability due to age. The best interests of the child should be taken into account in all actions affecting a child, aimed at ensuring both the full and effective enjoyment of all of the child’s human rights and the holistic development of the child. What is in the best interest of a child depends on the individual circumstances of the child.

The Regulation extends the emergency powers provided to emergency officers under the Public Health Act which include the power to restrict the movement of persons; require persons to stay at or in a stated place; require persons not to enter or stay at or in a stated place; and restrict contact between persons. These powers may impact children through, for example, temporarily restricting their movement, restricting the movement of family or other contacts, or restricting their access to certain facilities or events. Also, directions may not take into account the child’s views or give their views due weight, which does not respect their capacity to influence the determination of their best interests. However, there are other aspects of the child’s best interests protect which weigh in favour of their right to life and their health and wellbeing.

Right to humane treatment when deprived of liberty

The Human Rights Act states that everyone must be treated with respect when deprived of liberty. The use of force to enforce self-isolation or other directions could potentially implicate this right.

The Regulation has the potential to limit this right, as it will extend the emergency powers provided to emergency officers under the Public Health Act. The Regulation also extends the powers of emergency officers under the Public Health Act, allowing emergency officers to: prohibit a person from entering or remaining within a place; stay in a stated place; and stop using a place for a stated purpose. Failure to comply with these requirements without reasonable excuse is an offence with a maximum penalty of 100 penalty units.

Emergency officers (medical) also have the power to order detention of a person if that person has or may have a serious disease or illness. As soon as practicable after a person is detained, an emergency officer (medical) must request that the person be medically examined. Failure to comply with a detention order is an offence with a maximum penalty of 200 penalty units.

However, these public health directions constitute lawful orders and the use of force required will only extend to what is necessary and reasonable to enforce compliance under the Public Health Act.

Right to education

The right of every child to access primary and secondary education appropriate to their needs is protected in Queensland. The right to education also says that every person has the right to have access, based on their abilities, to equally accessible further vocational education and training.

The right to education is intended to be interpreted in line with the *Education (General Provisions) Act 2006* and to provide rights in relation to aspects of Queensland's responsibilities for education service delivery. Internationally, this right has been interpreted as requiring that education be accessible to all people without discrimination. Individuals may be temporarily restricted from attending schools or other educational institutions if they are subject to a direction to self-isolate in order to assist the containment of or arrest the spread of COVID-19 to the broader community.

The Regulation extends the emergency powers provided to emergency officers under the Public Health Act which include the power to restrict the movement of persons; require persons to stay at or in a stated place; require persons not to enter or stay at or in a stated place; and restrict contact between persons. This may limit certain educational activities, such as school assemblies or performances may also be temporarily restricted, however such restrictions would be without discrimination and for the broader purpose of protecting the community from COVID-19.

(b) the nature of the purpose of the limitation, including whether it is consistent with a free and democratic society based on human dignity, equality and freedom

Protecting the health and safety of the public is a fundamental responsibility of government and is consistent with a free and democratic society based on human dignity, equality and freedom. The purpose of the limitations on human rights to be imposed by the Regulation, if enacted, is to protect the Queensland public from serious risks to health and safety, including the potential for widespread loss of life that could occur if public health officials are unable to coordinate an effective public health response to the COVID-19 pandemic.

Although the number of active cases and instances of community transmission of COVID-19 in Queensland has been low, the risk of an uncontrollable outbreak in the absence of emergency powers is high. To ensure the Queensland Government can continue to respond to any potential outbreak of COVID-19 in Queensland, it is considered necessary to extend the declared public health emergency until 2 October 2020.

(c) the relationship between the limitation and its purpose, including whether the limitation helps to achieve the purpose

The limitation of human rights is necessary to ensure that public health officials can implement effective containment and mitigation measures in response to the COVID-19 pandemic. These measures will protect Queenslanders where possible from exposure to COVID-19 and, in the event of significant community exposure, slow the rate of transmission, particularly to vulnerable persons who may develop complications or otherwise require emergency or life-sustaining treatment.

The limitations are incidental to the provision of emergency powers to emergency officers appointed under the Public Health Act to implement restrictions, including quarantining people suspected or known to have been exposed to COVID-19. If these measures are not implemented and an outbreak of COVID-19 occurs in Queensland, demand for emergency and life-sustaining treatment could quickly exceed capacity and overwhelm the State's public health infrastructure. In addition to loss of life and serious adverse health impacts, this could potentially cause widespread economic disruption, social panic and civil unrest, further jeopardising the safety and wellbeing of the community.

(d) whether there are any less restrictive and reasonably available ways to achieve the purpose

The Public Health Act requires that a regulation be made to extend the declared public health emergency for a further period. Therefore, the extension of the declared public health emergency by the making of a regulation, which in turn extend the powers provided to emergency officers, cannot be achieved through any less restrictive means.

Given the risks to public health, the economy and other social impacts arising from a potential outbreak of COVID-19 in Queensland, it is critical the powers provided to emergency officers under the Public Health Act continue. If the declared public health emergency is not extended and the powers lapse, the ability for the Queensland Government to respond to any emerging outbreaks of COVID-19 would suffer significant detriment and could not be achieved through other less restrictive means, such as public messaging alone.

(e) the balance between the importance of the purpose of the limitation and the importance of preserving the human right, taking into account the nature and extent of the limitation

The benefits of significantly reducing Queenslanders' exposure to disease and preserving access to emergency and life-sustaining treatment for persons who develop serious health complications as a result of a COVID-19 outbreak substantially outweigh the limitations on human rights. Although the Regulation potentially limits a large number of rights, in many instances the limitations are minor in nature and the need to protect the right to life for all Queenslanders substantially outweighs any limitation on human rights.

Throughout the pandemic, the Queensland Government has actively assessed and reviewed the need for restrictive measures, such as social distancing restrictions and the requirement to close some non-essential businesses, to continue to be implemented to reduce the potential for transmission of COVID-19 across Queensland. These restrictions were eased as the number of positive COVID-19 cases had reduced and the potential for human transmission lowered.

Currently, the number of active cases and instances of community transmission of COVID-19 has been low, however, the risk of an uncontrollable outbreak in the absence of emergency powers remains high, particularly with the recent outbreak of COVID-19 in Victoria. The resurgence of the spread of COVID-19 in this region and in other parts of the world has shown that COVID-19 can spread rapidly. Therefore, the continuing threat of a potential resurgence of positive COVID-19 cases requires all governments, including Queensland, to remain vigilant and prepared to take prompt action to avoid major outbreaks occurring.

The Public Health Act states that the Regulation can only the declared public health emergency and related powers of emergency officers for a period of no more than 90 days. This requirement is an important safeguard as it places an obligation on the Queensland Government to continually assess the need for the declared public health emergency to continue based on the current threat of COVID-19 in Queensland.

If the need for the declaration of the public health emergency is no longer considered necessary, the Public Health Act also provides for the Minister to declare that the public health emergency has ended, which immediately extinguishes the emergence powers provided to emergency officers under the Public Health Act. This safeguard requires the Queensland Government to continue to assess the need for the public health emergency not just prior to the expiry of the declaration period but on a continual basis.

On balance, any limitations on human rights are reasonable and justified to ensure the preservation of life and protection of the community from the worse impacts of a pandemic.

Conclusion

I consider that the *Public Health (Further Extension of Declared Public Health Emergency—COVID-19) Regulation (No. 4) 2020* is compatible with the *Human Rights Act 2019* because it does limit, restrict or interfere with human rights, but the limitations are reasonable and demonstrably justified in a free and democratic society based on human dignity, equality and freedom.

STEVEN MILES MP
DEPUTY PREMIER
and MINISTER FOR HEALTH
and MINISTER FOR AMBULANCE SERVICES